



**BLUE RIBBON  
STUDY PANEL**  
ON BIODEFENSE

October 3, 2017

Hoover Institution  
1399 New York Avenue NW, Suite 500, Washington, DC 20005

---

**BIOLOGICAL ATTRIBUTION: CHALLENGES AND SOLUTIONS**

**Objectives**

Provide the Blue Ribbon Study Panel on Biodefense with a better understanding of the ability of the United States to: (1) identify pathogens and their sources correctly; (2) attribute biological crimes, terrorism, proliferation and warfare to their perpetrators, using scientific and other forms of evidence and information; and (3) explore the processes used for investigative, legal, policy, and political decisions involving biological attribution. Provide federal government, industry, and academic representatives with the opportunity to discuss their perspectives, experiences, challenges, and recommended solutions with regard to biological attribution. Address the current states of science, investigations, and intelligence for biological attribution and the extent to which they inform strategic, operational, and tactical decisions.

- What informal system for using biological attribution and making decisions based on this information has been and currently is in place?
- What are the major impediments and opportunities to establishing a national biological attribution decision-making apparatus?
- How do we better inform this apparatus with:
  - Standards/burdens of proof in the U.S. criminal justice system
  - A structured approach for policy decisions
  - Evidence, information, and intelligence which inform answers to key questions, including the source of the biological agent used
  - Accuracy, reliability, timeliness, credibility, and defensibility of this evidence, information, and intelligence
  - National security, diplomatic, political, geopolitical, and other policy considerations
- What organizational, legal, or policy changes are needed to ensure that all involved U.S. governmental agencies:
  - Possess needed microbial forensic capacity and capability to investigate biological crimes, terrorism, and warfare
  - Address each agency's missions and responsibilities as well as overall national priorities
  - Prevent, or reduce risk regarding, the use of other illegal activity for biological crime, terrorism, and warfare (e.g., compromise of cybersecurity systems, smuggling of cultural property, theft of intellectual property, corruption or compromise of critical biomanufacturing)?
- What biological attribution information would be required to involve the National Security Council and engage the National Command Authority in the event of a biological attack?
- How can we strengthen and foster leadership in this arena?

## Schedule – Open Session

### 10:00 – 10:15: Opening Remarks

- Former Homeland Security Advisor, Kenneth L. Wainstein, Panel Member, Blue Ribbon Study Panel on Biodefense
- Former Senate Majority Leader Thomas A. Daschle, Panel Member, Blue Ribbon Study Panel on Biodefense
- Former Senator Joseph I. Lieberman, Co-Chair, Blue Ribbon Study Panel on Biodefense

### 10:15 – 11:50: Panel One – Framing the Problem

*Current and former federal officials will discuss biological threats and their potential for large-scale consequences, and how these threats and consequences have been and would be exacerbated by the inability to obtain microbial forensic evidence.*

- Gerald W. Parker, Jr., DVM, PhD, Director, Pandemic and Biosecurity Policy Program, Scowcroft Institute for International Affairs, Bush School of Government and Public Service; and Associate Dean for Global One Health, College of Veterinary Medicine, Texas A&M University
- Nicolas Dunaway, Chief Biosecurity Officer, Inspirion Biosciences
- Edward H. You, Supervisory Special Agent, Biological Countermeasures Unit, Weapons of Mass Destruction Directorate, Federal Bureau of Investigation

### 11:50 – 12:10: Break to get lunch

### 12:10 – 1:00: Lunch Keynote – Amerithrax: Microbial Forensics, 16 Years Later

- Paul S. Keim, PhD, Regents' Professor and Cowden Chair, Department of Biological Sciences, University of Northern Arizona

## Schedule – Closed Session

### 1:00 – 1:10 Move to room for closed session

### 1:10 – 2:00: Panel Two – Evidence

*Federal law enforcement, military, and academic experts will discuss challenges in gathering microbial evidence, and impacts on the validity of related investigations and operational requirements.*

- Douglas L. Anders, PhD, Chief, Scientific Response and Analysis Unit, FBI Laboratory
- Nancy D. Connell, PhD, Professor and Director for Research, Division of Infectious Disease, Department of Medicine, Rutgers-New Jersey Medical School
- Jason W. Roos, PhD, Deputy Executive Officer, Joint Program Executive Office for Chemical and Biological Defense, Department of Defense

### 2:00 – 2:10: Break

### 2:10 – 3:00: Panel Three – Decision-Making

*Military, diplomatic, and academic experts will discuss how much evidence the Nation needs to make legal, policy, military, and political decisions, and how U.S. governmental leaders can deal with inherent uncertainty.*

- Commander Franca R. Jones, PhD, MS, Chief, Global Emerging Infections Surveillance Section, Armed Forces Health Surveillance Branch, Defense Health Agency, Department of Defense

- Laura J. Gross, Director, Office of Chemical and Biological Weapons Affairs; Bureau of Arms Control, Verification, and Compliance; Department of State
- Randall S. Murch, PhD, Associate Director, Research Program Development, National Capital Region, and Professor of Practice, School of Public and International Affairs , Virginia Tech

**3:00 – 3:15: Closing Remarks**

- Former Senator Joseph I. Lieberman, Co-Chair, Blue Ribbon Study Panel on Biodefense
- Former Senate Majority Leader Thomas A. Daschle, Panel Member, Blue Ribbon Study Panel on Biodefense
- Former Homeland Security Advisor, Kenneth L. Wainstein, Panel Member, Blue Ribbon Study Panel on Biodefense

**3:15 – 3:30: Adjourn**

**3:30 – 4:00: Brief Meeting with Panel Members, Ex Officios, and Staff**

*We will serve light breakfast, lunch, and coffee.*